

# Faculty Senate Minutes January 28, 2021 3:15pm Virtual Meeting

- Present: Lynne Bidwell, Kylee Britzman, Lauren Connolly, Erin Fay, Sue Hasbrouck, Natalie Holman, Leif Hoffmann, Lorinda Hughes, Bryce Kammers, J.R. Kok, Eric Martin, Spencer Payton, Alicia Robertson, Clay Robinson, Eric Stoffregen, Royal Toy, Heather Van Mullem, Scott Wimer
- Guests: Grace Anderson, Carrie Kyser, Billy Lemus, Jenni Light, Mercedes Pearson, Cynthia Pemberton, Lori Stinson
  - I. Call to Order @ 3:15pm
  - II. Introductions
  - III. Approval of Senate Meeting minutes from December 3, 2020

*Motion to approve minutes as amended made by Eric Martin, 2<sup>nd</sup> made by Alicia Robertson, motion approved (15 yes, 1 abstention).* 

- IV. Remarks:
  - i. President Pemberton
    - I have been fortunate to present information to the JFAC (Joint Finance-Appropriations Committee), the House and Senate Education Committees, as well as follow-up conversations and communications with others. Overall, I think that LC State has been represented well and that those with whom I have communicated are receptive to who we are and what we are about. Support for our situation has been positive.
    - 2. The Governor's recommendation that we are held harmless based on the enrollment workload adjustment. This is the funding mechanism for higher education in the State. This means that we will not lose another \$132,000, but last year's little over half a million is now part of our base reduction.
    - 3. It appears that there will be support for the nursing recommendation that the governor has put forward.
    - 4. The higher education stabilization funds (tuition that LC State collects but are put in reserve as a "rainy day" fund) have been discussed. There is question if it is time to



release these funds to the higher education institutions. LC State has requested that they be released. This is largely to replace lost revenues, as CARES funding does not permit spending on revenue. The gap between last March through fall semester is closing in on 2 million dollars and we have about \$1.7 million in the stabilization funds, should they become accessible.

- 5. While there has been a significant influx of money associated with CARES funds, the timelines and rules for expenditure are very specific. These one-time monies are helpful, but only for those items as designated.
- LC State will move forward with a 3.3% increase in tuition. This increase should help us get through assuming the governor's recommendation for CEC comes through.
- 7. There is still intention to reintroduce funds for advancement for faculty (promotion).
- ii. Questions:
  - Sue Hasbrouck I want to commend you for sticking by your guns for the tuition increase and not feeling like we have to follow the university pack on this. I encourage you to remain independent.
    - a. (President) I agreed to be a part of the agreement last year (kicking and screaming). I resisted it and it leads into why we are not making that statement this year.
    - b. CARES II money may permit us to mitigate the increase for incoming students next year. Nothing can be announced to the campus community at this time until we are sure that we can be completely compliant with federal regulations. Once we have that information we will market it as it will help people come to LC.
  - Eric Martin Please elaborate on the booklet shared by the Idaho Freedom Foundation that was being passed around the state legislature in terms of targeting diversity and inclusion. What do you think the impacts will be for LCSC?
    - a. I am asked that quite frequently and you may even recall some statements by the Presidents making the point that we don't teach students what to think, but teach them to think. One exemplar is that we had a Black Lives Matter event led by a student this summer with no adverse impact. I thread the needle from the standpoint of sharing the kind of students we have, what our students do, and reinforce our education mission. The notion of civility, mutual respect, and grace with each other is key. We submitted information to Senator Thayn (Chair of



senate education committee) following a request regarding student fees and their use.. LC State has longstanding programs, our office of minority, veteran, and native American services and supports, or diversity commission have been in pace since 2000. We have longstanding relationships with the tribes, in fact we occupy tribal land gratefully. We discussed diversity broadly. We need to keep doing what we do and maintain our core focus on our mission and treating each other well even if we don't always agree. I feel like I can support, defend, and be proud of LC State's long history of mutual respect and civility.

- Leif Hoffmann In your conversations with your peers (Presidents) is anyone planning to respond to the data presented in the report by the Idaho Freedom Foundation? Specifically, the definitions and data that are shared.
  - A: The Presidents have spoken in depth about this and the data are flawed. The State Board office, state board members, and different legislators are helping us with ways to respond. At this time there is no plan to respond in a formal report. If there is a need to respond based on LC State's best interests, I may call upon the faculty who have the knowledge and expertise to help craft something definitive as a response. The current path seems to be the right path as to not add credence to the report.
- 4. Is there a link to the report?
  - a. It can be sent out after the meeting. Attached as Appendix A Social Justice Ideology in Idaho Higher Education
- V. Division Updates No Report
- VI. Old Business
  - i. Policy 2.103 Curriculum proposed changes
    - 1. This policy did not allow administration to take steps needed to adjust to a negative financial situation.
    - 2. Walkthrough of the new suggested changes that were different from the previously shared policy by Faculty Affairs Committee, and the new suggestions made by Faculty Leadership.
    - 3. Provost Stinson Last meeting it was shared that the current policy does not support the administration in being responsive to fiscal realities. The current recommendations try to keep the spirit of communicating with faculty and providing opportunities for feedback while taking into account the direct action by administration needed for these situations.
    - 4. Leif The word "deletion" has been changed to "discontinuance" to align with the language from the state board of education.
    - 5. Policy and procedures have been separated in the newer version to clarify differences.



- 6. The major change is with the process for discontinuance as initiated by administration in contrast to discontinuance as initiated by a division. The administration-initiated discontinuance process would no longer include approval by the curriculum committee and senate, rather it will just call for feedback.
- 7. Questions/Thoughts Feedback
  - a. Royal Toy Point of clarification, Are we looking at only adopting the policy section and keeping procedures separate?
  - b. Leif Hoffmann Both would be included in the revised policy.
  - c. Provost Stinson While this is generally bad practice the procedures are included to ensure communication with faculty.
  - d. Feedback Humanities has not had a chance to discuss the issue.
  - e. Leif Hoffmann Is there a timeframe or time concerns? Does the possibility exist for us to push the decision to the next meeting?
  - f. Provost Stinson There is no deadline, but there are a number of proposals pending that we need to address. I would prefer to do so in the context of an updated policy but it is possible to proceed with administrative decision making for those things (program discontinuance) pending so that we can get the catalog updated and move forward.
  - g. Royal Toy Motion to approve the new changes as provided by faculty leadership with the idea that in the future, the suggestions are provided well in advance to ensure that the faculty and divisions have opportunity to see the changes and that we as senators can represent our constituents appropriately. In this case we have had enough time in deliberation about the original changes and intent for this policy.
  - h. Leif Hoffmann I do want to highlight that there is a significant difference in the role of senate and curriculum in terms of the input and feedback mechanism (in the new proposal), the other has an approval mechanism (the Faculty Affairs proposal). Since we do not own the policy, it is very likely that some amendment to the language will occur without our input if we do not approve this new version of policy.
  - i. Provost Stinson I want to be transparent and as forthright as I can be, administration needs the ability to have authority in very select cases. There may be more than one way to approach this issue; however, including a statement on policy seems the most ethical.
  - j. Royal Toy While there is a difference in the proposals, I do not see that is major as it does not seem to be significant when it comes to the practice of this type of policy. Senate is often asked to approve policies which have been vetted by other committees (of our peers) prior to coming to us. It seems in many cases that we are less informed about making a decision than those who have already approved the changes before us. In our prior conversations, during senate meetings, we have stated that we would trust our colleagues and their respective committees in the best interests of our divisions and departments.
- 8. Clarification of the motion to approve the revision shared by faculty leadership Made by Royal Toy seconded by Scott Wimer
  - a. Bryce Kammers I am not comfortable the level of autonomy stripped from faculty. I like the idea of governing at the division level.
  - b. Eric Stoffregen not comfortable seeing the changes without the time to review and receive feedback from the division as well as carefully reading over it myself.
  - c. Leif Hoffmann The issue here is that the most recent recommendations were just finalized last night after a flurry of activity and discussions between the provost and faculty leadership this week. The bottom line is that we reviewed the prior changes (the Faculty Affairs proposal) and if we go with this from last meeting, the language



will be rewritten and amended by administration as this is an administration policy. To avoid this, Lorinda, Sue, and I, in conjunction with the Provost, worked to include as much autonomy as possible for the faculty in this new proposal.

- d. Sue Hasbrouck If we are permitted time to revisit this, we separated approval and discontinuances in the future we are able to look at program changes separately. Approval still includes approval for players. It is really only discontinuances initiated by administration that the approval language is removed. This was deliberate in the change.
- e. Lauren Connolly Does Curriculum Committee have a say in this? It seems like it has gone through a number of committees and I am unclear about the process it went through.
  - i. Leif Hoffmann It was discussed in Faculty Affairs and has been discussed for a long time
  - ii. Provost Stinson The first draft began by Dean Chilson working with the Curriculum Committee before it was brought to Faculty Affairs

*Motion to approve the revision shared by Lorinda, Sue, and Leif made by Royal Toy, 2<sup>nd</sup> Scott, (12 yes, 5 no, 3 abstentions) motion passed.* 

- ii. Academic Affairs Reorganization
  - 1. Provost Stinson Thank you all for your good discussion on the last policy issue.
  - 2. That very same thinking is needed in for the reorganization of Academic Affairs. The charge was to look at it in the context of position reductions, industry needs and changes, and future opportunities. This has gone through many drafts, the one I will present is draft 10. We have worked on this design multiple times within and outside of the organization. We have an approved structure and I want to thank the division chairs for facilitating the distribution of the information for the new organization for us. The new proposal that will be shared soon was not like what you have seen and it is in response to feedback:
    - a. Helping divisions be more evenly sized
    - b. Looking for instructional synergies
  - 3. We landed on a big task list for the Deans and I to go through this term as a consequence of the new structure. I cannot share it with you today without talking with those who are most impacted first. As soon as these meetings have been concluded, the chairs will share it with you.
  - 4. When you do see it, please share comments about what are we forgetting or what we need to know, as we are permitting it to be reviewed in the context of your program. We do not need you to share information that has already been put forward. I would ask you as senators to please wear two hats and look at it from the broader institutional perspective, representing the institution as a whole, and from your division/program perspective. I am excited and glad to work with you all in this process.
  - 5. Question: Scott Wimer It seems like this went pretty quickly behind the scenes. Was there a reason for the expedience of the process, or had it been going on a long time?
  - 6. Answer: Provost Stinson The deans and I have been working on this a long time. Process going back to the end of summer and the beginning of the academic year.
- VII. New Business
- VIII. Committee Reports
  - I. Budget, Planning and Assessment Leif Hoffmann: Brief point of information that this

year's functional area committee process is currently under way with representatives



from CSO, PSO, and faculty observing. Overarchingly, this year's focus has been on the different units providing a plan for a 0% or flat division/departmental budget for the upcoming year. The faculty observation report will be shared with senate in preparation of next month's meeting.

- II. Curriculum Billy Lemus
- i. Senate approval needed for:
  - 1. MSS-CERT: Graduate Sport Coaching was passed by curriculum as well as the four courses needed for the certificate.
  - 2. Questions:
    - Scott Wimer:
    - a. Are there prerequisite courses? Heather Van Mullem None specifically aside from this being a graduate certificate.
    - b. What are the benefits to individual obtaining the certificate? Are they more marketable? Heather Van Mullem – There are a variety of potential benefits to individuals. Initially the origin may have been to serve student Athletes who may have eligibility remaining and want to continue playing sports here at LC. Also, this is for those who are active in coaching and want additional professional development. In this field, and at the national level, there is a move away from master's degrees and perhaps the stacking of certification that may lead to a masters in the future.
    - c. Why does the estimate cost to deliver the program not match that as listed in SBOE Budget form costs? No response today

Lauren Connolly:

- d. Is this program cost neutral? Answer: We have faculty who are qualified to teach and one of the faculty just published the updated coaching standards. The intention is that it is taught by current faculty. If we realize the growth we would like to see we may need to hire adjuncts.
- e. Lori Stinson We do not have graduate tuition approved yet, this should occur in the April meeting. In the beginning this may not be cost neutral, but we should be able to determine this in time. There are insights we cannot get w/o a few years of pilot.

Leif Hoffmann CEC conversations:

- f. Since we are starting to offer the graduate courses, will we share these courses as discounted with the other schools?
- g. Provost Stinson: We have not looked at this yet.

Scott Wimer:

- h. In general, can we expect to continue to see more certificate proposals as a precursor to future Master degrees? Is that the new process of "piloting" to get things going, so to speak?
- i. Provost Stinson Policy 3Z is a State Board policy that talks about the delivery of post-secondary programs. The current policy indicates statewide responsibilities. There are three universities that have assigned graduate level responsibilities. Generally speaking; University of Idaho has agriculture areas, Idaho State has Health professions. While specific programs will be removed



from policy, we will need to look at the specific responsibilities to see who we are in competition with. It is incumbent for us to be good players so that we are not duplicating programs and not incurring problems with declining enrollment. The Masters in Nursing has been with the North West Commission for some time due to the scope

*Motion to approve the MSS-CERT: Graduate Sport Coaching made by Royal Toy 2<sup>nd</sup> Lauren Connolly (18 Yes, 2 abstentions)* 

- III. Faculty Affairs
  - i. Lorinda Hughes We are trying to decide how to use the monies for faculty development. We are entertaining ideas regarding different Faculty Development speakers to come to campus or virtually. What mechanism will get the faculty members engaged on campus with whatever we bring? Send this information out to your divisions
  - Faculty Development grant deadline is still March 1, 2021 for applications for COVIDcompliant faculty research projects and for faculty attendance at virtual conferences. Questions: Heather Van Mullem – Amounts, should we seek out all instructional disciplines or invite programs to apply?
  - iii. We are open to any ideas, as we have at least \$10k to spend. If our ideas are great and wonderful perhaps the Provost will provide more funding.

Bill Hayne Recommended Dr. Johnny Lake as a speaker

Heather Van Mullem – There is a Zoom professional whom I would recommend and can get you information for later.

iv. Lorinda Hughes – Let us know how best to get this information out to people.
 Eric Martin – Resident Curmudgeon, after this term I need space and it would be amazing to reduce course load or other possibility.

Lorinda Hughes – Hopefully we can find a speaker that will provide you the space you need.

- IV. General Education No Update
- V. Student Affairs
  - i. Jenni Light We met Tuesday and are working on a philosophy about SCEs. The committee is soliciting colleagues. We also have updates to the student handbook that we are reviewing.
  - ii. Leif Hoffmann After review it come next to Senate February 18<sup>th</sup> for the Feb 25<sup>th</sup> Meeting. These are regular updates in regard to Title IX coming from the federal government.
- IX. Good of the Order
  - i. Senator Volunteers/Informal survey about new technology (Owls) in the classrooms If you have a classroom with these classes complete a survey and provide us with this feedback. If there are improvements that need to be made please bring this to the next senate meeting. Please also ask your students about their feedback.
  - ii. Ashley Edwards, our Title IX coordinator gave a captivating presentation at the President's Council meeting at the end of last semester on planning for active shooter scenarios on campus. After that presentation Leif Hoffmann spoke with faculty leadership and the Provost to have some discussion about when & how to talk about it. Should we invite Ashley to senate, faculty association, or should we not have this presentation at all?
    - 1. Eric Martin: I have mixed feelings about this.



- 2. Royal Toy Can this be part of our annual training?
- 3. Scott Wimer Not in Senate
- 4. President Pemberton I am not sure if we can deliver this in annual training. My thought is that Senate may be a helpful feedback forum to see how this may need to be delivered to the larger body of the faculty.
- 5. Provost Stinson At least one division has had the training and there may be PDT's out there that individuals can join.
- 6. J.R. Kok I've been part of emergency management after VT. We need site specific plans before presenting.
- 7. Eric Martin Anything we do needs to be site specific and if we have this part of annual training it needs to be a part of student orientation.
- 8. President Pemberton We have had a number of site visits and a lot of work done in background to the 20 min presentation that was shared in Council that are filed with the state and may be available online.
- 9. Lauren Connolly Referring to Lorinda Some divisions have had this training and it can be traumatic. I don't personally want to have any particular training unless it involves talking about gun control and talking to a state legislator about not having these problems in our community. We should not be in fear of our jobs because our state refuses to take a stance on weapons on campus and in our community. I realize I do not have a popular view in this region, and I realize this is controversial, but this training is not valuable without addressing the underlying issue. This is a solvable problem without traumatic training on this issue.
- 10. Royal Toy Perhaps a subcommittee if this is for feedback on the presentation.
- Spring 2021 Athletic competition schedule will be hectic when protocol compliance (college, NAIA) can be achieved, travel is being approved. All the fall sports are also competing this spring so it is very busy and many student athletes could be away from campus to compete. The schedule is dynamic depending on many variables. Please share this with your colleagues so that they can be aware of the issues relating to travel.
- iv. Last Lecture Model
  - Faculty leadership and interested faculty members have been discussing the creation of a last lecture model that has been a practice at other institutions. It has been decided to move forward with this in asking faculty leadership in conjunction with CTL and the provost's office to spearhead the project by reaching out to faculty members who are going up for emeritus/emerita status at the Faculty Association's March meeting.
- v. Grace Anderson & Mercedes Pearson
  - 1. Fall Faculty Survey sharing results
    - a. Mercedes we are here for feedback, if there are any questions.
    - b. Provost Stinson: This survey (a similar survey was given in spring/fall) The more recent survey has new modalities included.
    - c. There were some comments that individual units wanted to take action on, and it was not fair to take action until you had opportunity to look at it.
    - d. We chose not to include items that may have denied anonymity.
  - 2. Fall SCE experience
    - a. Formats Paper, Blackboard, Qualtrics It is good to see that our response rates for Qualtrics and Blackboard are in the same range as paper. Question Scott Wimer: Did you track the number of comments? I tend to have

fewer comments online vs on paper.

Answer Mercedes: We did not track that item.



- b. New SCE reports: Excited to announce that they were delivered last Tuesday. We were able to cut our time in half in compiling the survey. Page 1 has all of the items as a reminder of what is on the survey. The second page has the frequency of responses. The third page has a butterfly chart due to the Likert nature of the questions. The last page has the averages for the course, division average and college average.
- c. On the internet we added the important dates under the student course evaluations link.
- vi. Communication with the provost/deans, especially focus on the instructional side Information is moving so fast, how can we best communicate with you? This came across in the comments. We do not offer this as an expectation, but how can we make this better. Other institutions were conducting townhall meetings. The weekly Monday message and Tuesdays at two have filled this role. This can be at any level. Please reach out to me and be sure to include Leif and your faculty leaders.
- vii. Faculty Wisdom, a weekly email letter to students, contains hints and suggestions for students from faculty. As a reminder, if you have anything to share, contact Rachel Jameton, director of the CTL. Reach out to Rachel and Debbie with any nuggets of wisdom for students.
- viii. Provost Stinson We are trying to find better ways to communicate all of the changes, updates, and information to faculty. This is predicated on the comments from the faculty survey.
  - 1. Individuals have asked for more or different types of information. Our questions is, what can we do to provide feedback opportunities particularly to support students and instruction.
  - 2. Many other institutions are holding town hall meetings. We felt like this was too much as we meet with the ask and answer sessions, Tuesdays at 2, and burdening faculty with one more responsibility just felt like too much.
  - 3. Due to these conversations the Monday Message has morphed and become one of our primary sources of information for you. We understand that this may not always be clearly read, and rather than taking feedback right now, The deans and I stand ready to find ways to communicate with you on any level. If you have suggestions/comments, I would recommend that you copy your faculty leaders in it, as they may need to be aware of what you are finding to be effective.
- ix. Dr. Pemberton: President's Council reference to updated docs (encourage folks to review Council summaries): <u>https://www.lcsc.edu/media/7768086/LCSC-Pres-Council-Summary-11062020.pdf</u> LC emergency info and docs can be found at: <u>https://www.lcsc.edu/emergency</u>

Motion to adjourn made by Sue Hasbrouck, Heather Van Mullem (15 yes, 1 abstention)

A recording of this meeting is available at:

 $\label{eq:https://lcsc.zoom.us/rec/share/jaegbXMQnoIxnfKtPatXtU7utTVNyn4jaQyZr6HUhEoRaDvahkxECVdFq\\ \underline{8B4iT-T.Tw0BV4BxDWKRcmWm}$ 

(Access Passcode: 9.I2Tqt7)



Appendix A Social Justice Ideology in Idaho Higher Education

# Social justice ideology in Idaho higher education

By Dr. Scott Yenor & Anna K. Miller

December 2020

BOISE STATE



"The line dividing good and evil cuts through the heart of every human being."

Alexander Solzhenitsyn



# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Executive Summary	1
Recommendations for Reform	2
Social Justice Ideology in Idaho Higher Education	4
SECTION 1	
Administration Promotes Social Justice Education	7
How it Happened	8
Deans and Leadership	10
Social Justice Policies at Boise State	12
Inclusive Excellence Student Council	14

# SECTION 2

Curriculum and Student Experience	17
General Education Map	18
Department Map	20
Writing Center	22
Social Justice Departments Highlighted	24
Residence Halls	27
Conclusion	29
About the Authors	30
Works Cited	31



"There is the moral dualism that sees good and evil as instincts within us between which we must choose. But there is also what I will call pathological dualism that sees humanity itself as radically... divided into the unimpeachably good and the irredeemably bad. You are either one or the other."

– Rabbi Lord Jonathan Sacks





#### Social justice education poses a threat to education in America and to the American way of life.

Social justice education divides the world into aggrieved minorities and oppressive majorities. Wherever it is practiced, it compromises the achievement of truth, the free exchange of ideas, and the aspiration for assimilating people into the great American melting pot. It cultivates anger and resentment among the supposedly aggrieved, while undermining the stability and mutual toleration that contributes to individual happiness and good citizenship.

Universities are slowly building up an apparatus where social justice ideology is displacing education toward professions and general education. Some universities like Ohio State University have over 100 administrators dedicated to social justice. But all universities including Boise State University (BSU) have adopted an ideology that demands a built out apparatus.

Social Justice education at BSU is no longer in its infancy. It is heading toward maturity, spreading into hiring, policies, curriculum, and student life. BSU is adding to its social justice mission every year. We show this in several ways:

Administrators at BSU have repeatedly stated their commitment to developing a mature apparatus pushing social justice activism.

BSU has hired several administrators to push such initiatives since beginning its intentions to transform the university in Summer 2017.

Administrators have adopted policies in hiring and student experience to further the social justice cause and have announced a new emphasis on "inclusion and equity" throughout its colleges.

Social justice education has a significant presence in the General Education requirements at BSU.

- Social justice ideology plays a sigificant part in at least 14 departments at BSU.
- The Residence Hall experience is infused with social justice ideology, as is the Writing Center.

BSU is on the same path as universities like Ohio State University and it will continue on the path unless the political institutions of Idaho force change. We suggest budgetary and administrative ways of putting our universities back on the right track.



# **RECOMMENDATIONS FOR REFORM**

De-emphasizing and eliminating social justice initiatives at Idaho's universities is necessary for meaningful reform, as well as disrupting their ability to provide stable careers for social justice advocates. We recommend the Idaho Legislature implement nine reforms:

**CREATE MORE TRANSPARENCY** The Legislature should approve each university's budget separately. Separate budgets allow the Legislature to reward universities that stick to their core mission with more funding, while penalizing universities that continue to emphasize social justice education

**RESTRICT FUNDING TO PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES INFUSED WITH SOCIAL JUSTICE IDEOLOGY**. Restore funding to universities that pursue their core mission of advancing truth and supporting the common good; have reduced administrative bloat; and have proven these changes to the Legislature.

**ADOPT ADDITIONAL REPORTING REQUIREMENTS**. According to the Idaho State Board of Education's policies and rules, the core mission for institutions of higher education includes protecting academic freedom in research, teaching and learning for the purpose of the "advancement of truth" and serving the "common good."<sup>1</sup>

We recommend the following model language be added to education appropriation bills every year:

REPORTING REQUIREMENTS. It is the intent of the Legislature that each institution continue with budget reduction considerations and cost containment efforts and, where possible, priority should be placed on reducing administrative overhead and the elimination of expenditures that support social justice ideology and are not integral to each institution's core instructional mission as determined by the State Board policies and rules. The State Board of Education shall provide a written report each year detailing compliance to the Joint Finance-Appropriations Committee and the House and Senate Education committees detailing these budget reductions and cost containment efforts no later than January 15, 2022.



ADOPT A RESOLUTION THAT SOCIAL JUSTICE EDUCATION DOES NOT SERVE THE COMMON GOOD so that State Board policies can differentiate universities following their mission from universities which do not.

**ASSERT CONTROL OVER UNIVERSITY TUITION AND FEES.** Freeze tuition until universities returns to their core educational mission.

**CREATE A STUDENT CHOICE INITIATIVE ALLOWING STUDENTS TO OPT OUT OF STUDENT SERVICE FEES**. The law would allow all students to choose which student fees they want to pay and how that money would be allocated.

**DIRECT THE UNIVERSITY TO ELIMINATE COURSES** that are infused with social justice ideology.

**PROTECT FREE SPEECH ON COLLEGE CAMPUSES**. According to the Idaho State Board of Education, "Membership in the academic community imposes on administrators, faculty members, other institutional employees, and students an obligation to respect the dignity of others, to acknowledge the right of others to express differing opinions, and to foster and defend intellectual honesty, freedom of inquiry and instruction, and free expression on and off the campus of an institution."<sup>2</sup>

We recommend passing the following model legislation from the Foundation for Individual Rights in Education:

Campus Free Expression Act: This policy designates outdoor areas of public postsecondary educational institutions as traditional public forums open to free speech.<sup>3</sup>

College Student Free Speech and Association Act: This policy requires post-seccondary educational institutions to disclose how their policies protect free speech on campus.<sup>4</sup>

College Free Press Act: This policy protects the independence of campus media at public post-secondary educational institutions.<sup>5</sup>

Student and Administration Equality Act: This policy establishes procedural protections applicable to student conduct disciplinary proceedings at institutions of higher education.<sup>6</sup>

ELIMINATE SOCIAL JUSTICE INDOCTRINATION DEPARTMENTS, as defined on page 20 of this report.



# SOCIAL JUSTICE IDEOLOGY IN IDAHO HIGHER EDUCATION

America's colleges and universities have become increasingly liberal and radical over the past 50 years.<sup>7</sup> Academics and administrators are no longer merely pushing progressive politics. They aim to transform higher education into institutions dedicated to political activism and ideological indoctrination. This new ideological bent is known as social justice education.<sup>8</sup>

Social justice education reflects a diagnosis and a remedy.9 It offers a diagnosis of American society as made up of various structures of oppression built by the privileged to keep disadvantaged groups weak, unequal, and scattered. Under this ideology, America, for example, is seen as having a patriarchal, racist, Christian, European, homophobic, cisgendered, and ableist culture. But universities promise a remedy. They teach students to identify, shame, and destroy oppressors by retraining their minds. They teach "oppressors" to identify with the plight of victims and encourage remedial activism on their behalf, while feeling shame for what makes them superior such as their "whiteness" or "toxic masculinity." The result, its proponents seem to think, will be a new, healthy respect for diversity and inclusion. Freed of oppressive structures, all people will be recognized in their basic human dignity regardless of their race, ethnicity, language group, social class, gender identity or expression, sex, sexual orientation, disability status, etc. Or so the official promise reads.

Totalitarian temptations are rooted in social justice education. **Its advocates demand conformity–**  victims are only members of oppressed classes. The use of such words as "diversity," "inclusion," or "equity" require people to believe that America is on the treadmill of oppression and victimhood. Social justice activists have committed countless acts of violence on and off campus during the past few years—and staged others.<sup>10</sup> Their claims of "white privilege" have gone somewhat mainstream in the Black Lives Matter movement. **Cities like Portland, Seattle, and Minneapolis have burned, and campus life has been disrupted all over the country**.

Social justice education undermines freedom under the law and social harmony.<sup>11</sup> It denies the reality that inequality and privilege are complex social phenomenon that come about in many different ways, not just from oppression. It is false and pernicious.

What is more, there is no way to get from social justice ideology to a peaceful, unified, and happy nation.

This report is based on the idea that social justice undermines the common good. It asks: **How far has social justice ideology advanced at Boise State University?** 

Addressing this question requires that we understand BSU's social justice plans and how far it has advanced toward execution of those plans.

Section I discusses the ambitions of administrators,



as expressed in reports, policy changes, and mission statements. Higher-level administrators like university presidents, provosts, and deans explain where the university is headed. Policies surrounding free speech or bias incidents reveal how far things that contradict the social justice ideology are tolerated on campus. Offices and requirements dedicated specifically to social justice education are telltale signs of its advances. Section II discusses the execution of these plans. Department mission statements, program learning outcomes, and required courses tell us how far individual departments provide social justice. General education requirements shape the education experience of students as well. Residence hall directors provide direction to student life outside of the classroom.

"He who knows only his own side of the case knows little of that."

– John Stuart Mill









Universities are complex organizations. A layer of administrators sits at the top. These administrators set the strategic mission and tone for the university. They hire personnel and adopt policies to carry out that mission.

Administrators are relatively free to make changes in offices under their direct control, such as Title IX compliance, admissions, and human resources. They can set long-term plans and direct academic deans to craft new mission statements. They can make policies surrounding hiring and free speech. They hire those in charge of student experiences, such as residence halls directors and vendors providing services.

Underneath administrators are permanent faculty. Administrators must often collaborate with the existing faculty in order to effect the changes they would like to see, especially on broad curricular changes.

Students can also leverage change or resist it. Politically radical students can "force" changes on administrators, as happened in the late 1960s, when administrators caved to demands from students and some faculty.<sup>12</sup> Many worry about "tenured radicals" transforming university education.<sup>13</sup> But the picture is more complex.

Faculty members can slow some administrative initiatives surrounding diversity and inclusion if they are committed to professional norms like scientific objectivity (i.e., physics) or the provision of service (i.e., nursing). Faculty can also abet those changes if their professional norms, as they see them, demand the furtherance of social justice ideology (i.e., social work).

An honest evaluation of an administration's commitment to social justice education requires an investigation of the areas where administrators have some freedom in carrying out their vision.

For BSU, we investigate administrative plans to prioritize social justice education; the mission statements of colleges and schools; and policies relating to hiring, the creation of offices, and free speech, and to empower student activists.

Conclusion: BSU administration is committed to building a social justice institution. Social justice culture has grown beyond its infancy and is headed toward adolescence.





## **JULY 2017**

President Bob Kustra's Commission on Diversity and Inclusion issued a report recommending "that Boise State begin the process of building a comprehensive institution-wide strategic plan for diversity and inclusion."<sup>14</sup>

Kustra's commission thought the university must spearhead transformative change in Idaho. Defeating oppression and victimhood would become central to BSU's mission. "Our institution and those that lead it have reinforced cultural, structural, and personal norms of what success looks like in Idaho and rural America."

The "true success" of a new university and a new Idaho would center on "inclusive excellence—achieved through a 'self-reflective and uncompromised commitment to the practice of inclusivity, which seeks to break from implicit and limiting biases that reify exclusionary practices." The university would "replace dominant cultural norms" with a more "welcoming culture" by devising concrete steps to promote social justice.

## AUGUST 2017

Francisco Salinas is hired as director of Student Diversity and Inclusion with a budget funded through student fees.

## **JUNE 2019**

Interim President Martin Schimpf released an email to faculty and staff lauding accomplishments in promoting social justice and announcing new initiatives to begin under the new president, Marlene Tromp.

Accomplishments included: establishing scholarships for illegal immigrants; establishing implicit bias training for faculty on search committees; having job searches undergo "statistical analysis for assessing number of underrepresented candidates in the pool"; and setting aside scholarships specifically for "underrepresented minority students."

Future plans include hiring an associate Vice President for Diversity and Inclusion and mandatory preferred pronoun system with faculty training. Schimpf expressed "every confidence that Dr. Marlene Tromp has the background, experience and drive to take Boise State to new levels of diversity and inclusive excellence."



## FALL 2019

The job search began for Vice Provost for Equity and Inclusion.

## SPRING 2020

The job search was suspended when the COVID-19 pandemic began, though at least one candidate had been to campus.

## FALL 2020

The BUILD program was established as "an independent entity in service to [the] campus" and to "address important needs that extend beyond the classroom." The BUILD program is tasked with contributing to "an inclusive climate campus wide," supporting "inclusive faculty hiring" and creating "inclusive departmental environments." Two new hires—Tasha Souza, director of BUILD, and Jeremy Harper, instructional consultant for Inclusive Teaching—support this mission. The BUILD program will be under the new Vice Provost for Equity and Inclusion when that job search is complete.

Conclusion: There is no limiting principle to BSU's ambitions to build a social justice infrastructure. It will build what it can afford and get away with. BSU has adopted the core propositions of social justice ideology and believes its mission involves destroying oppressive structures and elevating alleged victims. If this is its core mission, the logic demands even more commitment to realizing that vision.



# DEANS & LEADERSHIP

**Dnce a university announces its commitment to social justice education, it must permeate into its colleges and schools.** This usually happens in a familiar pattern. First, the university adopts social justice ideology. Second, social justice ideology makes its way into statements of shared values. After those statements of shared values are accepted, mission statements must be changed to integrate social justice aspirations into college and school objectives. Once those objectives are set, schools and colleges usually hire associate deans dedicated to diversity and inclusion. This is how Ohio State University came to have 100 or more administrators committed to diversity and inclusion. BSU has adopted shared values of social justice across its colleges.

Mission statements set the overall strategic direction for academic units. They are also crucial for the accreditation process. Accreditors judge academic units on whether they are fulfilling their own mission statements. If universities' colleges or schools have social justice aspirations in their mission statements but are not fulfilling them, they will produce reports insisting that universities allocate more funds and resources to fulfill those missions. Mission statements are thus leveraged through the accreditation process. Colleges and schools across BSU have integrated social justice statements into their shared values.

**The College of Business and Economics (COBE)** Mission Statement has not changed since 2016, but its "shared values" have changed. It valued "relevance, respect, and responsibility" in 2016. In January 2018, COBE faculty and staff posted an "intentional culture document" on its website. Its new core values include "inclusive excellence" as a "strategy for both communicating and demonstrating that we value, seek, engage, promote and include a rich diversity of stakeholders."

**The College of Engineering** has also adopted an emphasis in social justice education. According to its 2020 Mission Statement and Core Values.

"We excel through: Inclusion and Diversity; Innovation; Integrity." On its website, engineering claims also to embody BSU's "active commitment to diversity and inclusion."

**The Graduate College** aspires to help "the university maintain a culture of inclusiveness, collegiality and ethical behavior through its dedication to diversity, fairness and integrity."

Conclusion: College and school mission statements understate how much social justice ideology is infused into BSU experience. Leadership is taking steps to elevate the profile of "diversity and inclusion" and "inclusive excellence" in the colleges and schools.



It's an universal law—
intolerance is the first sign of an inadequate education. An ill-educated person behaves with arrogant impatience, whereas truly profound education breeds humility."

– Alexander Solzhenitsyn



# SOCIAL JUSTICE POLICIES AT BOISE STATE

Social justice policies arise especially in recruitment and hiring, as well as oversight of student conduct and student support. BSU is not sufficiently elite to practice affirmative action overmuch in student admissions or in hiring.

**CAMPUS SECURITY:** BSU announced it would not renew its contract with Boise Police Department (Boise PD), after consulting with student activists. In the meantime, it requires all Boise PD officers to take implicit bias training if they are assigned to campus.<sup>15</sup>

**HIRING:** BSU boasts that it offers its faculty "implicit bias training" as part of its recruitment efforts for new faculty. Best practices are to find candidates who satisfy the minimum qualifications and then allow diversity considerations to guide hiring. Human Resources also certifies all job pools against statistical measures to ensure that recruitment, application pools, interview pools, and final candidate pools are guided by adequate affirmative action.

**FACULTY TRAINING:** In a letter in August of 2019, Interim President Schimpf explained his plan to use a grant to grow the Center for Teaching and Learning's BUILD Forum. BUILD provides workshops and trainings "designed to recognize and reflect upon our perceptions around implicit bias in the classroom and workplace." According to Schimpf, "dozens of faculty and staff have gone through the program and many more are in process — as many as there is capacity to accommodate."<sup>16</sup>

BUILD is now its own entity. Training is voluntary (for now), but this is the camel's nose in the tent. What starts as mandatory likely becomes compulsory under the social justice education model.

**ENHANCED HARASSMENT AND ANTI-DISCRIMINATION POLICIES:** (Adopted March 2020). The Foundation for Individual Rights in Education (FIRE) judges Boise State's policies to be in its Yellow category.<sup>17</sup> Yellow policies compromise free speech since they make the alleged victim the judge over whether a violation of university conduct has happened, or the policies tilt the scales against free speech and toward proscribing categories of speech, but do not target specific categories of speech.

For example: Policy 1060 defines Harassment as follows: "Unfair treatment, abusive words or expressions, or intimidating or threatening behavior aimed at any member of the campus community based on a protected class (e.g., religion, race, national origin) should be reported to the Office of Institutional Compliance." BSU policy defines a "hostile environment" as "conduct is so severe, pervasive, or persistent that it creates an environment that would cause a reasonable person substantial emotional distress."

Policy 2065 prohibits bullying and makes the allegedly bullied the judge of such bullying. "Bullying someone on the basis of sex or gender. .. may include repeated use of degrading words, gestures, or sounds to describe a person."



**TITLE IX**. Boise State has adhered to Title IX regulations of the Obama and Trump administrations. When the Obama Administration's Dear Colleague letter went out demanding lesser procedural protections for rape accusations,<sup>18</sup> BSU adhered. When the Trump Administration rescinded that letter, BSU changed its policy as per the regulation but has taken actions to create the conditions for readopting the Obama administration's policies.

According to liberal and feminist professors,<sup>19</sup> many campuses seek to create the impression of a "rape crisis" on campus by educating students into identifying ever more acts as rape; encouraging students to report such acts and telling victims that they will be believed; and issuing increasing numbers of "timely warnings" to the student body in order to leave the impression that young men are preying on young women, which in turn justifies a weakening of due process on campus.

BSUs Title IX office uses its student orientation and its timely warning process to create the impression that the university has a general rape problem. It has sent out duplicate timely warnings during the Fall 2020 Semester. On Oct. 30, 2020, University Counsel Alicia Etsey even issued a timely warning for an anonymous claim, with the effect of creating the impression that BSU has some sort of a crisis on its campus. Contrary to these efforts, official statistics reported through the university in its Clery reporting process show that the number of rape allegations declined from 2015-2017 to a low of 9.<sup>20</sup>

**LACK OF TRANSPARENCY.** BSU has tried to hide its administrative efforts and plans centered around social justice in several ways:

BSU removed Kustra's 2017 Commission on Diversity and Inclusion report from its website.

A representative partially denied a lawful public records request issued by IFF regarding implicit bias training.

A representative has not produced documents regarding the Big City Coffee scandal pursuant to a lawful public records request issued by IFF.

Sources within the Dean's council have told us that the university is scrubbing the word "diversity" from its website because the

Legislature does not like it. It is replacing "diversity" with words like "equity, fairness, inclusion" and so on.

Conclusion: Boise State has created racial and gender-based tiers for hiring faculty and is putting resources behind "implicit bias" and other social justice initiatives in its teacher training. It accepts the architecture of policies that prohibit free speech and provide special protection for supposedly aggrieved minorities on campus.



# HE INCLUSIVE EXCEL

A key element in the social justice ideology at BSU is its Inclusive Excellence Student **Council** [IESC]. The IESC seems to be a successor organization of the Council for Inclusive Excellence founded after Kustra's Commission on Diversity and Inclusion. IESC is fully integrated into the student government and university administration.

. 0 0

IESC's mission is to have "student activists ... advocate[] for the validity of their existences within Boise State's institution, and in a system that kept marginalized communities from being able to access a culturally relevant education that de-centers: white supremacy, transphobia, homophobia, xenophobia, racism, classism, sexism, ageism, ableism, and any other discrimination or bigotry."

Duties of the IESC include advising faculty, staff and administration on policies and the broader environment on campus. Examples of such duties include:



Advise and address administrative leadership on diversity and inclusion efforts.

Hold the greater Boise State University accountable to its Statement of Shared

Values, Commitment to Diversity and Inclusion, and the Student Code of Conduct.

Serve as an advisory board to organizations and departments associated with students and the campus community.

Members are appointed to the IESC by the IESC in conjunction with Salinas and Vice President of Student Affairs and Enrollment Management Leslie Webb. It seems to be a self-perpetuating system. BSU pays students to occupy positions on IESC and to provide muscle for hard-core student activism.

#### **IESC Seeks Control Over Campus Contracts**

This year Boise State signed a contract with a local small business, Big City Coffee, to replace Starbucks on campus. Big City's owner, Sarah Fendley, is engaged to Kevin Holtry, a Boise police officer. Holtry was shot five times in the line of duty while pursuing an armed and dangerous fugitive.<sup>21</sup> He is now in a wheelchair. To honor her fiancé, Fendley displayed a Blue Lives Matter flag in her original shop, located in downtown Boise.

The Vice President of IESC soon complained that the university used "limited white feedback" when it selected Big City Coffee and that "political affiliation and race weren't considered."22 The vendor process, she held, was an example of "white supremacy."

Administrators and advisors for the IESC agreed with the characterization and encouraged IESC students to take an active role in university hiring, contracting, and other policy matters in the future. Webb assured IESC that the school would "create a better process moving forward," one presumably including feedback from the IESC when it considers university vendors and hires. Webb said she had already informed the university's vendor for dining



services of the school's new process. "I do believe we missed it and got caught in the urgency of [getting Big City under contract]," Webb said in the meeting. "The timeline got condensed in order to get something in and it is not a thorough or inclusive process."<sup>23</sup> Webb committed "to action oriented movement for the future."

Salinas joined the crusade. He proposed a shake down to hold "Big City accountable by providing scholarships to marginalized students."

"In contracts you can ask for human rights to be a part of it. That is a step moving in the right direction and will begin to influence others," Salinas told the students.<sup>24</sup> Pushback against Big City Coffee and getting them to leave could be, Salinas continued, "the beginning of a revolution where we say that we have a standard for corporate partnerships that we have."

Officer Holtry told KBOI-AM's Nate Shelman

that BSU officials did meet with his fiancé, and they proposed her company provide scholarships and jobs for "people of color" as a concession for remaining on campus.

Previously, the university honored Officer Holtry at half times during football games.

The university could have easily reiterated their support for Officer Holtry and Big City Coffee. It didn't. In this case, Big City Coffee's support for law enforcement was enough for the campus administration and IESC to create a hostile environment so untenable that exiting was its only viable option.

#### Impeachment of Student Body President

The student government, led by the IESC, impeached its student body president on the allegation that he supported extending BSU's contract with the Boise Police Department.

CONCLUSION: IESC is a university-funded, self-perpetuating council that aims to intimidate the student body into compliance on a narrow agenda and serve as a prod to take the administration into more extreme social justice measures on campus, including a role in approving university contracts. Where will the demands of the IESC end? Will BSU ever be able to say "no" to IESC, given their plans for Social Justice education?



# "THIS COULD BE THE BEGINNING OF A REVOLUTION ..."

Francisco Salinas
 Assistant to the vice president for equity initiatives









#### Social justice education is the new civics education.

A student's academic life is divided between general education requirements of approximately 40 credits hours, major requirements usually between 30-45 credits hours, and electives. One hundred twenty credits are required for graduation.

How many credits of social justice education must BSU students take? This number is different for different students. Sometimes it depends on the luck of the draw – some teachers emphasize social justice education while others in a different section might not. There is some variation in course selection for students as they fulfill general education requirements. Different majors also yield more or less social justice education. Social work and sociology majors can expect nothing but social justice education in their majors, while nursing majors may only receive it from their general education courses.

No measure of social justice education is perfect.<sup>25</sup> We have imagined the student experience as a path through general education and then through a major.

**GENERAL EDUCATION**. Our report uses course catalogue descriptions for general education courses as a reflection of course content. Sometimes faculty from a department infused with social justice ideology teach courses without an explicit social justice framework. We label such courses as Social Justice Education Courses. Examples of some course descriptions for Social Justice Education Courses can be found on pages 18 and 19.

**MAJORS**. Our report measures the degree to which social justice ideology captures departments. We judge departments based on four factors: department mission statements; program or department learning outcomes; contributions to the general education; and required major courses. Red departments are infused with social justice ideology throughout these four factors. Yellow departments have elements of social justice ideology in two or three factors. Green departments have little or no social justice ideology in their programmatic statements. Examples of these factors and a more detailed description of our measurement can be found on pages 24-26.

Conclusion: Students encounter social justice education throughout the curriculum at BSU. Students cannot avoid exposure to social justice education, though they can avoid American history, government, and literature.









\* (continued) "...Yet, Western society includes many groups that are outside of, or are not exclusively identified with, this mainstream culture. Gay men, lesbians, bisexuals, transgender people experience difficulty in a society that does not grant them the social standings and legal rights given to heterosexuals. Mainstream customs in America often ignore or marginalize American citizens who are Muslim, Buddhist, Hindu, or other non-Christian religions. Despite substantial progress, women still face discrimination as do people who are not white."



# INDOCTRINATION MAJORS

$\cdots $	Gender Studies	Sociology	Global Studies	Social Work®	History
-----------	----------------	-----------	----------------	--------------	---------

Gender Studies: The program offers gender/sex/sexuality/intersectionality/ diversity/ race theory courses, and/or courses taught with an interdisciplinary lens. It seeks to provide students with an opportunity to learn about all forms of hierarchy and power relations which in turn perpetuate gendered socioeconomic and political structures. In other words, it encourages students to think outside the box and engage in critical thinking regarding the ethics and politics of equality and justice, and links the questions of gender and sexuality (both men and women) to all forms of hierarchical differences. Multicultural and interdisciplinary in approach, the Program seeks to address many of the current social, economic, professional, media, individual, and public policy issues revolving around discussions of gender and sexuality. Students examine the experiences of women and men and concepts of gender and sexuality within different cultural, social, economic, and religious contexts through the study of scholarship and creative works in a variety of fields. Thus, the course work seeks to provide students with essential preparation for lives and careers deeply impacted by ongoing debates regarding gender and sexuality in our society.

Sociology: We study the key divisions of society: The social order, social inequality, social change, class, race, gender, labor, and sexuality. The Department of Sociology is a Community for Social Change, Social Justice and Equality.

Global Studies: Analyze and appreciate the diversity of different cultures. Analyze the role of social justice, diversity, social well-being and inclusion at global, national, and local levels.

🕈 Social Work: A field of study dedicated to human rights, social and economic justice, egalitarianism, and respect for diversity.

History: Responsiveness—to the needs of our students and our changing world. Diversity and Inclusivity—in our curriculum and in our university culture. Advocacy—For the unique and important value of history as a discipline. Engagement—With our students and our communities, meeting them where they are.

# SOCIAL JUSTICE IN TRAINING

$\cdots \rangle \cdots$	Environmental Studies	Secondary Education	Literacy, Language & Culture	Geosciences	Psychology
	Community & Environmental Health <sup>®</sup>	Theatre Arts <sup>®</sup>	Urban Studies & Community Development®		

Community & Environmental Health: Equity: We believe that health is a human right. Access to safe and clean environments, housing, a livable wage, health, and preventative services are matters of social justice.

Theatre Arts: Analyze the roles of social justice and diversity in communities, cities and regions.

♥ Urban Studies & Community Development: We stand for diversity, equality, inclusivity, kindness, and compassion. We are committed to transformation. As part of this movement, we vow to: 1. Examine our own actions and make changes within our hearts, our homes, our educational systems, and our community; 2. Foster open dialogue within our department; 3. Actively seek applicants of color for full-time and tenure-track teaching positions; 4. Actively seek students of color to join our community as both undergraduate and graduate majors; 5. Participate in and host community events related to promoting equality and social justice; 6. Create works of art that address injustice; 7. Listen with the intent to understand and take appropriate action; 8. Stand and speak and write and take action against racism in any form.

# PROFESSIONAL DEPARTMENT

$\cdots \rightarrow \cdots$	Creative Writing	World Languages	Special Education	Kinesiology	Mathematics
	Physics	Chemistry	Anthropology	Biology	Civil Engineering
	Finance	Accountancy	Radiologic Sciences	Nursing	Economics
	Computer Science	Political Science	Philosophy	Music	Respiratory Care









**Even the Writing Center is infused with social justice education**. It affects the basic writing courses (see page 18) and the courses that train writing teachers. The following is from the Writing Center's "Our Training's Mission" found on its Google Site:<sup>26</sup>

"In brief, we identified our mission as increasing critical awareness of privilege among consultants and helping equip them to participate in conversations about social justice within the Writing Center and the university context. Our goals for this training can be broken out in detail as follows:

Consultants should understand privilege — both their own and that of students they work with.

Consultants should be mindful of "how one's own experiences have shaped these [cultural] expectations, and how to recognize and respond to such biases," as described in §6.1 of Boise State's university-wide learning outcomes<sup>27</sup> for students.

Consultants should have a shared vocabulary with which to describe social justice issues. In order for conversations about social justice to succeed, we need to be talking about the same issues. Familiarity with basic terminology (privilege, ideology, oppression, marginalization, equality versus equity, etc) is vital.

Consultants should have to wrestle with the issue of when to speak up about oppressive ideologies or actions. Do students with problematic papers deserve a safe space in the Writing Center? What does it mean for us to respect their views? Do we have a responsibility to intervene, or is there room for a consultant to choose to let it slide?

Consultants should "respect all identities, cultures, and points of view writers bring to the Center," as described in our mission statement.

Our Writing Center should make diversity of consultants a priority. Our Writing Center's staff is — and has historically been — almost exclusively white and female. Although the final decision is up to the directors, veteran consultants are highly involved in the hiring process, screening and recommending candidates and conducting official interviews; thus, it's important that diversity be on our minds.

Conclusion: Even the writing center is a place dedicated to social justice ideology at Boise State.



"Mass movements can rise and spread without belief in a God, but never without belief in a devil."

– Eric Hoffer



# SOCIAL JUSTICE DEPARTMENTS HIGHLIGHT

## **GENDER STUDIES**

2020 Mission Statement from its website: "The program offers gender/sex/sexuality/intersectionality/diversity/ race theory courses, and/or courses taught with an interdisciplinary lens. It seeks to provide students with an opportunity to learn about all forms of hierarchy and power relations which in turn perpetuate gendered socioeconomic and political structures." Encourages "students to think outside the box and engage in critical thinking regarding the ethics and politics of equality and justice, and links the questions of gender and sexuality (both men and women) to all forms of hierarchical differences."

## CORE COURSES

GENDER 200 Introduction to Gender Studies: "Interdisciplinary, multicultural introduction to gender studies that provides foundation for further study. Draws selectively from scholarship and creative work of various fields to examine how concepts of gender shape lives, personal relationships, and social institutions. Gender issues will be studied from a multicultural perspective across lines of class, race, and ethnicity."

GENDER 301 Feminist Theory: "Students encounter new perspectives by examining major theories directly useful to scholars in search of understanding and explaining gender relations."

## HISTORY DEPARTMENT

2020 Mission Statement from its website: The department is committed to "excellence in:

Diversity and Inclusivity – in our curriculum and in our department and university culture. Advocacy – for the unique and important value of history as a discipline. Engagement – with our students and our communities, meeting them where they are."

2020 Program Learning Objectives:

"Deliver curriculum that addresses the diverse needs, interests and identities of the students. Elevate our graduate program to a position of regional distinction in quality and relevance."



## SOCIOLOGY DEPARTMENT

2020 Mission Statement from its website: "We study the key divisions of society: The social order, social inequality, social change, class, race, gender, labor, and sexuality." The department is "a Community for Social Change, Social Justice and Equality."

2020 Program Learning Objectives: "Become An Agent Of Social Change: You want to better understand the cultures and social structures of societies throughout history. You want to better understand yourself, and your place in the world. You want to better understand the nature, causes and consequences of the inequalities and oppressions associated with race, class, gender, sexuality, age and ability. We are interested in the social order, social inequality, and social change."

## CORE COURSES

SOC 101 Introduction to Sociology: "Emphasis is on sociological perspectives, concepts, methods, and applications in areas such as organization, socialization, inequality, institutions, intergroup relations, change, etc."

#### **Social Work Department**

2020 Mission Statement from its website: The department is "dedicated to human rights, social and economic justice, egalitarianism, and respect for diversity."

2020 Program Learning Objectives: Foster inclusiveness, cultural competence, and sensitivity.

Competency 2: Engage Diversity and Difference in Practice Competency 3: Advance Human Rights and Social, Economic, and Environmental Justice Competency 5: Engage in Policy Practice

## **Criminal Justice**

While the Criminal Justice mission statement has no social justice language, social justice ideology is central to how they see their program. As their 2020 Anti-Racism statement shows:

There is no place for the racial injustices that have historically and continuously plagued Black, Indigenous, and other People of Color (BIPOC). Boise State University's Criminal Justice Program actively stands against racism and oppression in any form. Racism has always been present in our society. It did not end with the abolishment of slavery or Jim Crow-era segregation of Black citizens or treaties with Indigenous peoples; it was infused into all of our systems and institutions. As a program that is housed within one of these institutions (academia) and studies another (the criminal justice system), we acknowledge our multiple responsibilities to students and communities to engage in anti-racist work. And yet, as faculty who are predominantly White and hold privileged places in our communities, we understand the importance of our own individual and group anti-racism education...



#### ... This fall, the Criminal Justice Program will:

Convene listening sessions with our students and alumni from marginalized communities to better understand their experiences in our classrooms and address their concerns; and work with students and community stakeholders to review our policies, practices, and curriculum to ensure we are not complicit in furthering racism and oppression within our communities...

Form a diverse working group of people within and outside of the University to identify areas where we can utilize our knowledge and skills to assist in eliminating policies and practices that have disproportionately impacted BIPOC and other marginalized communities through systemic, institutionalized, and individual racism and oppression.

The task ahead of us is substantial. It will not be easy to dismantle racism in our communities and institutions, but as citizens we have no choice. We must act. Too many lives have been lost and many others harmed. The listening sessions, outreach, and working groups described above are just the beginning. Feedback from those efforts will be used to navigate future steps toward fighting for a more just and equal society.

CJ 103 INTRODUCTION TO LAW AND JUSTICE (3-0-3)(F, S)(FS). Examines issues of social justice; e.g., poverty, racism, sexism, alienation, and use of law for social control.

#### How We Categorized Departments:

Departments dedicated to social justice ideology reveal their commitment in their mission statements, learning outcomes, general education offerings, and courses required by their majors. These four indicators of social justice ideology are measured on a 12-point scale. Departments most committed to social justice (earning three points on each indicator) have the following traits:

- 1. Affirming diversity, social justice, empathy, equity, inclusion, identifying oppressive power structures;
- Aligning the department's mission against -isms and -phobias, including, but not limited to sexism, racism, classism, xenophobia, homophobia, transphobia, Islamophobia, ableism, dispossession of indigenous peoples.
- 3. Rejecting or questioning the basis of national identity in favor of identities at the subnational or transnational level.
- 4. Commitment to activism as opposed to study. Departments get three points if they express a commitment to social justice without any mitigating factors.

Departments get two points if they express a commitment to social justice in any of these indicators but also acknowledge other approaches to viewing the material. Departments with ambiguous commitments to social justice — either with ambiguous statements or no pride of place for social justice ideology—receive one point. Departments with no reference to social justice ideology get zero points.





Much of student experience is outside the classroom, through programming designed by residence hall directors and the broader division of student life. We can see what Residence Life seeks to accomplish through its mission statements and by who Residence Life hires. Personnel is policy.

# **MISSION STATEMENTS**

Language emphasizing social justice programming in residence halls was nonexistent until the 2010-2011 Academic Catalogue. Previously, University Housing was seen as a business relationship between the university and students. At most, the residence halls would be "vibrant and diverse," but those values would not be promoted; students would meet people from other states or other countries. Beginning in 2011, Residence Life staff emphasized it would promote "inclusive, safe, and caring communities."

## 2020 Mission and Vision:

Mission: "Housing and Residence Life provides a vibrant residential experience that promotes inclusiveness, learning, academic excellence, and meaningful relationships."

## Values:

Community – Collaboration, interdependence, intentional connections, and a sense of belonging Learning – Critical thinking, continuous development, and exploration Respect – Inclusive acceptance, compassion, and authenticity

Housing and Residence Life is committed to creating a safe and inclusive environment that values diversity and promotes equity. Our values – community, learning, and respect – inform our Community Standards so as to increase education and promote understanding.

# Residence Hall Directors (Personnel)

BSU has many residence halls, each with a resident director whose biography is available on the university website. Their biographies reveal that the promotion of social justice must be part of the selection criteria for hiring resident directors.

University Square Director "is very interested in working towards a more just and inclusive campus experience for all students."



Taylor Hall Director "hopes to advocate for inclusive communities."

Towers Hall Director is "passionate about building safe, inclusive communities where every member has the support they need to be successful" and has been involved in smearing local businesses as white supremacist because they support police.

Chafee Hall Director "loves to create caring, welcoming, and inclusive residential communities."

Driscoll, Keiser and Morrison Halls Director "seeks to create inclusive spaces where students find a sense of belonging within their campus community."

Summer Housing Coordinator "is passionate about fostering a positive, inclusive and productive workplace culture."

Only the Sawtooth Hall Director lacks reference to social justice ideology, though she does include personal pronouns in her statement.

Conclusion: Residence Life is thoroughly permeated with social justice ideology, so that residents cannot avoid it in most campus life.

"Justice is the first virtue of social institutions, as truth is of systems of thought..." – John Rawls





Boise State seeks to transform the "dominant culture" of Idaho with what it claims is a new "welcoming" culture of diversity and inclusion.

This task is unfinishable and unworthy.

Unfinishable because it simply cannot be done. Unworthy because the culture of Idaho was already welcoming and inclusive. BSU has begun the task of empowering Social Justice ideologues around campus and it has announced plans to hire a Vice Provost to oversee these efforts.

Policies like ending the Boise Police contract and blackballing Big City Coffee presage greater involvement of social justice activism on campus. The curriculum and student experience in the residence halls are trending in this same direction.

Over the next few years, we can expect an unchecked BSU to change its mission statement to include social justice commitments, to bolster its shared values to include more equity language and perhaps mandatory enforcement of the values and add additional staff to support its social justice mission, especially staff in the provost's office.

This is happening all over the country, with many universities further along the path than Boise State. Recognize, however, that Boise State is on the same path.

Stopping this transformative agenda before it develops to maturity is a task the Legislature and the State Board should set for themselves.



# **ABOUT THE AUTHORS**



# **DR. SCOTT YENOR**

Scott Yenor is a Washington Fellow at the Claremont Institute's Center for the American Way of Life, and a member of the National Association of Scholars. He writes extensively on marriage and family life in the contemporary world, including his most recent book *The Recovery of Family Life: Exposing the Limits of Modern Ideologies* (Baylor University Press, 2020). He also writes on higher education, American Reconstruction, David Hume, and other topics for numerous websites including Law Liberty, City Journal, First Things, and The American Mind. He neither endorses nor opposes the policy positions reflected in this report (on pages 2 and 3).

# ANNA K. MILLER

Anna is the Education Policy Analyst at Idaho Freedom Foundation. She is an alumni of the MA Fellowship at the Mercatus Center at George Mason University. She lives in Boise, Idaho with her husband, Brock. Anna earned her M.A. in Economics from George Mason University (2020) and a B.A. in Philosophy, Religion, and Ancient Greek and Roman Studies as a division one student athlete from Furman University (2017). Anna's work has been published in the Wall Street Journal, The Hill, The Detroit News, The Washington Examiner, and The Daily Caller among others.



Idaho State Board of Education Governing Policies and Procedures Section II: III. Postsecondary Affairs. Subsection: B. Academic Freedom and Responsibility | Idaho State Board of Education
 Idaho State Board of Education Governing Policies and Procedures Section II: III. Postsecondary Affairs. Subsection: B. Academic Freedom and Responsibility. See III.B. - Academic Freedom and Responsibility | Idaho State Board of Education
 Fireedom and Responsibility. See III.B. - Academic Freedom and Responsibility | Idaho State Board of Education
 Fireedom and Responsibility. See III.B. - Academic Freedom and Responsibility | Idaho State Board of Education
 Firee Campus Free Expression Act, See Campus-Free-Expression-Act - FIRE (thefire.org)

WORKS CITED

4. FIRE College Student Free Speech and Association Act, See College-Student-Free-Speech-and-Association-Act - FIRE (thefire.org) 5. FIRE College Free Press Act, See College-Free-Press-Act - FIRE (thefire.org)

6. FIRE Student and Administration Equality Act, See Student-and-Administration-Equality-Act - FIRE (thefire.org)

7. See Sam Abrams and Amna Khalid, "Are Colleges and Universities Too Liberal? What the Research Says about the Political

Composition of Campuses and Campus Climate<sup>7</sup> Heterodox: The Blog. https://heterodoxacademy.org/blog/are-colleges-and-universitiestoo-liberal-what-the-research-says-about-the-political-composition-of-campuses-and-campus-climate/ (accessed December 2, 2020). 8. For example, Jonathan Haidt and Greg Lukianoff, "The Coddling of the American Mind: How Good Intentions and Bad Ideas are Setting up a Generation for Failure" (New York: Penguin Press, 2018); Heather MacDonald, "The Diversity Delusion: How Race and Gender Pandering Corrupt the University and Undermine our Culture" (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2018); and David Randall, "Social Justice Education in America" (New York: National Association of Scholars, 2019).

9. Helen Pluckrose and James Lindsay, "Cynical Theories: How Activist Scholarship Made Everything about Race, Gender, and Identity and why this Harms Everybody" (Pluckstone Publishing, 2020), and generally James Lindsay's website newdiscourses.com. See also Scott Yenor, "The Recovery of Family Life: Exposing the Limits of Modern Ideology" (Waco: Baylor University Press, 2020), Chapter 9. 10. Wilfred Reilly, "Hate Crime Hoax: How the Left is Selling a Face Race War" (New York: Regnery, 2019).

11. James Lindsay's work is especially interesting in this regard. Lindsay is a disaffected liberal who has written profound articles such as "Wokeness Threatens the Rule of Law" (https://newdiscourses.com/2020/11/wokeness-threatens-rule-of-law/) and "For Racial Healing, Reject Critical Race Theory." (https://newdiscourses.com/2020/10/racial-healing-reject-critical-race-theory/)

12. See Allan Bloom, "The Closing of the American Mind" (New York, Basic Books, 1988), For an account of how the turmoil of the late 1960s erupted at Cornell and other elite colleges and universities.

Roger Kimball, "Tenured Radicals: How Politics Has Corrupted our Higher Education" (New York: Ivan R. Dee, 2008).
 This report has been taken down from the Boise State website.

15. KTVB Staff. Boise State Enters Last Year of Contract with Boise Police Department, Aug. 2020, www.msn.com/en-us/news/us/boise-state-enters-last-year-of-contract-with-boise-police-department/ar-BB17I169.

16. All quotations are drawn from Schimpf's letter, available at https://idahofreedom.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/schimpf-letter1.pdf 17. See https://www.thefire.org/schools/boise-state-university/

18. For text of this letter, see https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/letters/colleague-201104.html

19. See Aya Gruber, "The Feminist War on Crime: The Unexpected Role of Women's Liberation in Mass Incarceration" (Berkely: University of California Press, 2020), pp. 151-169.

20. See Boise State, Annual Security and Fire Safety Report, available at https://www.boisestate.edu/publicsafety-security/campus-crime/ annual-security-report/ (accessed Dec 3).

21. City of Boise. "Corporal Kevin Holtry." www.cityofboise.org/departments/police/about/medal-of-honor/corporal-kevin-holtry/.

22. See 9/29/2020 Meeting Minutes: 09292020\_IESC Minutes (boisestate.edu)

23. See 9/29/2020 Meeting Minutes: 09292020\_IESC Minutes (boisestate.edu)

24. See Meeting Minutes: 09082020\_IESC Minutes (boisestate.edu)

25. A more complete study would also require a measure of how much experiential learning students must or can take during their time at Boise State. Experiential learning is almost always in the service of a Left-wing, Social Justice cause established through a department committed to it. See Randall, "Social Justice Education in America," pp. 78-80 and 143-148.

26. See https://sites.google.com/a/u.boisestate.edu/social-justice-training/about-us/our-mission (accessed on Dec 3, 2020).

27. See https://www.boisestate.edu/academics-uf/ (accessed on Dec. 5, 2020).





IdahoFreedom.org 208-258-2280

Our goal is to implement innovative ideas to deplete the power of special interests and free people from government dependency.



*Claremont.org* 909-981-2200

Our mission is to restore the principles of the American Founding to their rightful, preeminent authority in our national life.